March 25, 2016

Department of the Interior
Office of the Assistant Secretary – Indian Affairs
ATTN: Office of Federal Acknowledgment
1951 Constitution Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20240

RE: Petitioner No. 005

Dear Sir/Madam:

We do not wish to take a position concerning the recognition of the Piro/Manso/Tiwa of San Juan de Guadalupe, but we do have serious concerns about how portions of our research has been presented in the material submitted to the Office of Federal Acknowledgment. We are especially concerned that certain facts may have been distorted and/or omitted in such a way to leave the reader with conclusions that we did not find to be true.

We have over one hundred combined years of research into the history and anthropology of the Greater El Paso area. Based on that research, we concluded that ceremonies in honor of Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe, which included Pueblo-style dances, were brought to Las Cruces by settlers, both Hispanic and Indigenous, from Paso del Norte (modern Cd. Juarez). These traditions had been intermingled for centuries at Paso del Norte and were from the beginning entwined when Las Cruces was settled. Anglo settlers mistakenly identified anyone who danced in these ceremonies as being "Indian."

There is no evidence Cayetano Roybal was ever casique at Paso del Norte. He was identified as a genizaro in the church records. Marcelino Gemente was casique in 1857. It is unclear who the casique was in the 1836 document.

People who were designated Indigenous at El Paso del Norte did not migrate to the Mesilla Valley as a distinct organized group but as individuals and families over a 40-year period.

People who participated in ceremonies that included costumed dancing were mis-identified as “Indian.” This mis-identification was done almost routinely in newspaper accounts of ceremonies and also by the people associated with Tortugas.
The place called Tortugas is composed of two distinct villages; each with its own unique history. The villages are called San Juan de Dios and Guadalupe. Each of these villages have people who have both Hispanic and Indigenous ancestry. Ceremonies performed at Tortugas are a mixture of Indigenous and Hispanic traditions.

There is no evidence there was a separate Piro Pueblo at any time in that part of Las Cruces designated by the petition as having been the original “Old Indian Neighborhood.” The people living there did not form a separate community. Its residents had both Indigenous, Hispanic and mixed ancestry.

The disagreement between Victor Roybal, Sr. and the Los Indígenes de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe Corporation (Corporation) developed into a split in the Corporation that eventually led to the formation of a new group in the 1970s, the San Juan de Guadalupe Tiwa (SJGT). The new group considered themselves as having Tiwa heritage, and the Corporation was left with a mixed group of Hispanic and Indigenous members.

The Corporation has always been composed of Indigenous, Hispanic, and Anglo people, and continues to have Indigenous members. The petition does not list at anytime the membership of the Corporation, and consequently, it would seem there are no Indigenous people in the Corporation, only in the Piro/Manso/Tiwa of San Juan de Guadalupe (PMT) group. This is not true.

The SJGT used the Tiwa designation until sometime in the late 1980s because they all believed they originated from Isleta del Sur. The SJGT only changed their name to PMT after genealogical research was done in 1981 to 1983. All group activities conducted by and participated in, which were identified as being “Indian” before the late 1960s, were organized by the Corporation.

Sincerely,

Terry R. Reynolds, Ph.D

Terry L. Corbett

Patrick H. Beckett, MA